

2012 台灣  
金瓶梅  
國際學術研討會論文集

國立成功大學人文社會科學中心主辦

陳益源 主編

## 2012 台灣金瓶梅國際學術研討會

### 主辦單位

國立成功大學人文社會科學中心

### 合辦單位

國家圖書館漢學研究中心、國立臺灣師範大學國文系、  
國立中正大學圖書館、復旦大學中國古代文學研究中心

### 協辦單位

國立中正大學文學院/中文系、國立成功大學文學院/中文系、  
中國金瓶梅研究會

### 補助單位

行政院國家科學委員會、中華發展基金管理委員會、  
國立成功大學「邁向頂尖大學計畫」推動總中心、里仁書局

## 目次

主任序	戴 華	I
主編序	陳益源	III
「金學」史上的一座里程碑——追念魏子雲先生	黃 霖	1
從文本看《金瓶梅》的作者	梅 節	17
建構魏子雲先生手稿資料典藏兼析往來書信	李壽菊	25
20世紀《金瓶梅》詮釋中的價值取向	王 平、張明遠	53
從詩詞韻文運用看《金瓶梅詞話》的民族性	張蕊青	73
《金瓶梅》「禮物」書寫初探	高桂惠	87
試論《金瓶梅》的諧謔藝術	張文德	131
論《金瓶梅》中的偷窺與竊聽	史小軍	149
論《金瓶梅》創作主體意識的價值及其影響	曾慶雨	167
《金瓶梅》對晚明城市寺僧之物質生活寫照	陳玉女	179
於談諧處透露真信息		
——《金瓶梅詞話》引入《寶劍記》、《抱妝盒》意圖新探		
	霍現俊	215
一樣「世情」，兩種「演義」——詞話本與說散本《金瓶梅》題旨比較		
	李志宏	227
《金瓶梅詞話》與崇禎本《金瓶梅》敘事者之比較	徐志平	259
張竹坡評點《金瓶梅》之史稗比較芻議	孫秋克	281
《金瓶梅》評點論略	吳 敢	297
王忬「偽畫致禍」真偽考辨		
——以《清明上河圖》為中心	許建平	319

明代帝諱與《新刻金瓶梅詞話》刊本的諱字問題	
——從帝諱角度對現存「萬曆本」刊刻版次及年代的梯次考證	
.....楊國玉.....	339
也談《金瓶梅詞話》中的「不如不年下」.....	張進德.....361
女丑的藝術——《金瓶梅》暨明清小說中姑婆形象析論	
.....朱嘉雯.....	371
《金瓶梅》的女性人物及其處境：以二「蓮」為例.....	黃錦珠.....389
父權凝視下的女性情欲——《金瓶梅》中潘金蓮之媚道再詮釋	
.....劉淑娟.....	415
「虎中美女」與「紙虎兒」——封建婚姻制度下的潘金蓮	
.....石鐘揚.....	457
《金瓶梅》春梅人物塑造得失談.....	程小青.....473
《金瓶梅詞話》對《花影集》的借鑒	
——由陳經濟棲身晏公廟故事說起.....	趙興勤.....481
從《西廂記》到《金瓶梅》	
——文風之轉變對豔情小說推展之關係試論	
.....謝明勳、謝文華.....	501
演本還是讀本？	
——從《金瓶梅詞話》看《西廂記》在萬曆時期的傳播型態	
.....楊緒容.....	521
從張竹坡的「奇酸說」到李斗的《奇酸記》.....	陳維昭.....537
魚龍混雜——文化翻譯學與越南流傳的《金瓶梅》.....	阮南.....555
原汁原味還是走味？	
——論 Clement Egerton 與 David Roy 英譯《金瓶梅》中的鹹溼描寫	
.....鄭怡庭.....	593
滿文譯本《金瓶梅》敘錄.....	王汝梅.....635

《金瓶梅》的文化本位觀念與仇外話語的英譯.....	洪濤.....643
《金瓶梅》韓文本的翻譯底本及翻譯現狀.....	崔溶澈.....669
論《金瓶梅》及其續書之「鞦韆」意象運用.....	胡衍南.....687
《續金瓶梅》的家國書寫	
——「李師師」的形象衍義及隱喻.....	傅想容.....705

## 原汁原味還是走味？

——論 Clement Egerton 與 David Roy 英譯《金瓶梅》中的  
鹹溼描寫

國立臺灣師範大學東亞學系助理教授

鄭 怡 庭

### 摘 要

《金瓶梅》的英文全譯本主要有二。一為 The Golden Lotus，此譯本共四卷為 Clement Egerton 翻譯 1939 年由倫敦 G. Routledge 出版社出版。另一譯本 The Plum in the Golden Vase 為美國芝加哥大學著名漢學家芮效衛 David Tod Roy 翻譯。該譯本由美國普林斯頓大學出版社出版，預計出版五卷，目前已出四卷且每卷副標題皆不同（The Gathering 1997, The Rivals 2006, The Aphrodisiac 2006, The Climax, 2011）。

Egerton 與芮效衛兩人的英譯版本有顯著的不同。本文以兩人的翻譯風格入手，進而以性愛為例，特別強調西門慶與潘金蓮生殖器官的首次出場以及最有名的第二十七回 潘金蓮醉鬧葡萄架和第三十七、三十八回西門慶與王六兒肛交橋段為例，探討兩人翻譯風格的主要差異，最後利用本雅明（Walter Benjamin）在〈譯作者的任務〉（The Task of the Translator）一文中的理論，認為 Egerton 與芮效衛分別代表傳統翻譯的兩個概念即譯文自身的不拘一格與忠實於原著譯者。並探討兩位譯者所處的文化背景、當時社會風氣、發表譯作的刊物等如何造成兩個版本的差異，又如何使兩個版本呈現截然不同的風貌。

## Introduction

*Jin Ping Mei*, *The Golden Lotus* according to Frederick Clement Christie Egerton's translation or *The Plum in the Golden Vase* according to David Tod Roy's translation, is no doubt one of the greatest Chinese novels.<sup>1</sup> Scholarly studies of *Jin Ping Mei* has been so prosperous that a literature called *jinxue* 金學, Jin-ology, was created in twentieth-century China. Jin-ology covers a variety of research topics including its author (s), publication dates, editions, character and linguistic analysis, modes of narration, culture studies, material culture, and translation studies.<sup>2</sup> There have been more than ten translations of *Jin Ping Mei* into different languages including English, French, German, Russian, Japanese, and Korean.<sup>3</sup> Of the three English translations of *Jin Ping Mei* including Bernard

<sup>1</sup> For questions of translating the book title *Jin Ping Mei* into English, see Zhang Senlin 張森林 and Wang Xiaotie 王小鐵, "Jin Ping Mei shuming yingyi chuyi," 《金瓶梅》書名英譯芻議》*Xuzhou shifan daxue xuebao* 《徐州師範大學學報》 no. 4(1991): 76-7, Shi Yuda 石欲達, "Zhongguo gudian xiaoshuo shuming yingyi zhong de deyushi," 〈中國古典小說書名英譯中的得與失〉*Waiyu yanjiu* 《外語研究》48(1996): 19-24, and Yang Chunquan 楊春泉, "Jin Ping Mei shuming de lijie ji yingyi wenti," 〈《金瓶梅》書名的理解及英譯問題〉*Shidai wenxue* 《時代文學》no. 12(2011): 216-7.

<sup>2</sup> For a detailed development of Jin-ology in China, Taiwan, and abroad, see Naifei Ding, *Obscene Things: Sexual Politics in Jin Ping Mei* (Durham, NC: Duke University Press, 2002), pp. 3-45.

<sup>3</sup> For a general introduction of translations of *Jin Ping Mei*, see Wang Lina 王麗娜, "Jin Ping Mei zai guowai" 〈《金瓶梅》在國外〉 in Hu Wenbin 胡文彬 and Zhang Qingshan 張慶善 eds., *Lün Jin Ping Mei* 《論《金瓶梅》》(Beijing: Wenhua yishu chubanshe, 1984), pp. 449-64 and Wang Lina, "Jin Ping Mei zai guowai xushu"

Miall's *Chin P'ing Mei: The Adventurous History of Hsi Men and His Six Wives*, Clement Egerton's *The Golden Lotus: A Translation from the Chinese Original of the Novel Ching P'ing Mei*, and David Roy's *The Plum in the Golden Vase or, Chin P'ing Mei*, only the latter two are unabridged renditions. Egerton used the "chong zhen edition" (崇禎本) and Roy used the "cihua edition" (詞話本) for their translations. Published by John Lane publishing company in London in 1939, Miall's 49-chapter translation was based on Franz Kuhn's German translation, *Kin Ping Meh oder Die abenteuerliche Geschichte von Hsi Men und seinen sechs Frauen* which was originally published in 1930.

Egerton's *The Golden Lotus* was first published by G. Routledge in London in 1939. According to Robert Hegel, Egerton's translation has undergone 25 editions since its first appearance in 1939.<sup>4</sup> In the first edition Egerton deleted much of the original poetry because he claimed:

Nobody would, I think, claim that they are masterpieces of Chi-

〈《金瓶梅》在國外續述〉 in Du Weimo 杜維沫 and Liu Hui 劉輝 eds., *Jin Ping Mei yanjiu ji* 《《金瓶梅》研究集》(Jinan: QiLu shushe, 1988), pp. 329-45, and Chapter Four: *Jin Ping Mei* of Part V: Ming Literature in Song Bonian 宋柏年 ed., *Zhongguo gudian wenxue zai guowai* 《中國古典文學在國外》(Beijing: Beijing yuyan xueyuan chubanshe, 1994), pp. 442-66. For a general introduction of English scholarship and translations of *Jin Ping Mei*, see Wen Xiuying 溫秀穎 and Sun Jiancheng 孫建成, "Jin Ping Mei de liangge Yingyiben," 〈《金瓶梅》的兩個英譯本〉*Zhongguo tushu pinglun* 《中國圖書評論》no. 7(2011): 113-6 and Huang Weizong 黃衛總, "Yingyu shijie zhong Jin Ping Mei de yanjiu yu fanyi," 〈英語世界中《金瓶梅》的研究與翻譯〉*Ligeng xuekan* 《勵耕學刊》no. 2(2011): 167-75.

<sup>4</sup> Robert Hegel, "General Introduction," in Lanling Xiaoxiaosheng, *The Golden Lotus*, Clement Egerton trans., 2 vols., (North Clarendon, VT: Tuttle Publishing, 2011), vol. 1, p. 18.

nese poetry, and some of them, turned into English, seemed very much like gibberish. I have allowed myself much more liberty with them and have omitted a great many. After all, they are merely conventional trimmings to the story, and I have no qualms of conscience about them.<sup>5</sup>

But he kept almost all of pornographic scenes. However, these juicy parts were rendered into Latin because Egerton felt it “necessary not to cut out any of the details of behavior given by the author.” And he was convinced that “such details were included in the original not for the purpose of titillating the reader’s palate for the salacious, but because they, too, indicate shades of character that, given the author’s stylistic limitation, could not be indicated any means.”<sup>6</sup> Fortunately, the translation into English of the pornographic portions formally in Latin was added in a reprint by the publishing company Routledge & Keagan Paul in London in 1972. The restoration of the pornographic passages to Egerton’s translation gives English readers a chance to fully appreciate the controversy of the novel. As William Nienhauser rightly points out that “the most controversial aspect of *Chin P’ing Mei* is the explicit descriptions of sexual activity that have earned it the leading reputation of a pornographic classic.”<sup>7</sup>

### Two Translators : Clement Egerton and David Roy

<sup>5</sup> Clement Egerton, “Translator’s Introduction,” in Lanling Xiaoxiaosheng, *The Golden Lotus*, Clement Egerton trans., 2 vols, (North Clarendon, VT: Tuttle Publishing, 2011), vol. 1, p. 22.

<sup>6</sup> Ibid., p. 24.

<sup>7</sup> William Nienhauser ed., *The Indiana Companion to Traditional Chinese Literature* (Bloomington: Indiana University Press, 1986), vol. 1, p. 290.

The easiest way to differentiate Egerton and Roy as translators of *Jin Ping Mei* is that compared with David Roy who has been devoted more than forty years of his academic life to studying and translating *Jin Ping Mei*, Clement Egerton happens to translate *Jin Ping Mei* by accident without professional knowledge of Chinese literature in general and of Ming-Qing fiction in specific. As Egerton admits this accident :

It was more or less accident that made me choose the *Jin Ping Mei* as a suitable novel for my original purpose. I first came across it in Cordier’s *Bibliotheca Sinica*. He says of it there, “In it there is set before us a whole company of men and women in all the different relationships that arise in social life, and we see them pass successively through all the situations through which civilized human beings can pass. The translation of such a book would render superfluous any other book upon the manners of the Chinese.”<sup>8</sup>

It is well-known that Lao She 老舍, pen name for Shu Qingchun (舒慶春 1899-1966) helped Egerton translate *Jin Ping Mei*. Egerton was thankful and put Lao She’s name in “Translator’s Note” in the very end of his introduction. Egerton writes :

Without the untiring and generously given help of Mr. C. C. Shu, who, when I made the first draft of this translation, was Lecturer in Chinese at the School of Oriental Studies, I should never have dared to undertake such a task. I shall always be grateful to him.<sup>9</sup>

Lao She offers first-hand accounts of how he and Egerton became

<sup>8</sup> Egerton, “Translator’s Introduction,” p. 24.

<sup>9</sup> Ibid., p. 25.

friends and how Egerton went through financial difficulty because of alimony in the article "My Several Landlords." In this article, Lao She wrote that they lived together from 1924 to 1926 but never mentioned their collaboration on *The Golden Lotus*.<sup>10</sup> In addition to Lao She's own words, Hu Jinquan (胡金銓 1932-1997) gives a very detailed accounts of the relationship between Lao She and Egerton in *Lao She and His Works*.<sup>11</sup>

Unlike Egerton who "made no attempt to produce a 'scholarly' translation,"<sup>12</sup> as himself has claimed, David Roy's translation of *Jin Ping Mei* is definitely a scholarly endeavor. He is professor emeritus of Chinese literature at the University of Chicago, where he has studied and taught *Jin Ping Mei* since 1967. Four of a planned five-volume series have been published since 1993.<sup>13</sup> Compared with a short 4-page Introduction in Egerton's translation, Roy's translation consists of a 32-page Introduction, a 56-page list of Cast of Characters, a 30-page Bibliography, and a 38-page

<sup>10</sup> Lao She 老舍, "Wode jige fangdong" (我的幾個房東) in *Lao She wenji* 《老舍文集》 16 vols. (Beijing: Renmin wenzue chubanshe, 1980-1991), vol. 14, pp.

<sup>11</sup> Hu Jinquan 胡金銓, *Lao She he tade zuopin* 《老舍和他的作品》 (Hong Kong: Wenhua shenhua chubanshe, 1977). For a full English translation of the part related to Lao She and Egerton, see Cecilia Y.L. Tsim trans, "Lao She in England," *Rendition* 19 (Autumn, 1978): 46-67.

<sup>12</sup> Egerton, "Translator's Introduction," p. 22.

<sup>13</sup> These published volumes include *The Plum in the Golden Vase or, Chin P'ing Mei*, vol. 1, *The Gathering* (Princeton: Princeton University Press, 1993), *The Plum in the Golden Vase or, Chin P'ing Mei*, vol. 2, *The Rivals* (Princeton: Princeton University Press, 2001), *The Plum in the Golden Vase or, Chin P'ing Mei*, vol. 3, *The Aphrodisiac* (Princeton: Princeton University Press, 2006), and *The Plum in the Golden Vase or, Chin P'ing Mei*, vol. 4, *The Climax* (Princeton: Princeton University Press, 2011).

Index in Volume One alone. Pages of notes, bibliography, and index increased drastically volume by volume. For example, the total counts of notes pages in volume two, three, and four are 104, 132, and 166.

Of the numerous research topics in Jin-ology, translation study of *Jin Ping Mei* remains a much neglected area. Only two master theses are devoted to the study of English translation of *Jin Ping Mei* in China. One applies "one divides into three" theory to study Egerton's translation and the other uses equivalence theory to analyze the Chinese folk wisecracks in Egerton's translation as well.<sup>14</sup> Topics of the very few essays related to studies on English translations of *Jin Ping Mei* include problems regarding to translating poetry, crying, puns, dirty jokes, foreign instruments, and metaphors into English.<sup>15</sup> Almost all Chinese and English readers of *Jin*

<sup>14</sup> See Qi Lintao 齊林濤, *A Study of English Translation of Jin Ping Mei Under the Vision of "One Divides into Three"*. Master's thesis, Henan Daxue, 2011 and Liu Jing 劉競, *On C-E Translation of the Chinese Folk Wisecracks in Chin Ping Mei from the Perspective of Equivalence Theory*. Master thesis, Hunan Shifan daxue, 2010.

<sup>15</sup> These essays include Huang Fenbao 黃粉保, "Jin Ping Mei zhong shige jiqi Yingyi pingxi," 《《金瓶梅》中詩歌及其英譯評析》 *Yunmeng xuekan* 《雲夢學刊》 31.1 (2010): 138-41, Huang Fenbao, "Jin Ping Mei yingyiben xuanyi ce lue kao," 《《金瓶梅》英譯本選譯策略考》 *Qinghai minzu daxue xuebao* 《青海民族大學學報》(2011)no. 1:127-31, Li Zhihua 李志華, Ji Shenglei 姬生雷, and Fu Zhimin 傅之敏, "Wenzue fanyi yu wenhua queshe—yi Jin Ping Mei Yingyiben zhong 'ku' de fanyi weili," 《文學翻譯與文化缺失—以《金瓶梅》英譯本中“哭”的翻譯為例》 *Shijiazhuang xueyuan xuebao* 《石家莊學院學報》 12.4 (2010): 106-8, Hong Tao 洪濤, "Jin Ping Mei cihua de wailai yueqi yu minsu wenhua—jianlun xiangguan de Yingyi wenti," 《《金瓶梅詞話》的外來樂器與民俗文化—兼論相關的英譯問題》 in *Jin Ping Mei yu Linqing* 《金瓶梅與臨清》 (Jinan: QiLu shushe, 2008),

*Ping Mei* know that the book is famous/notorious for its pornographic descriptions of sexual activity. These juicy parts were so poisonous that it had to be completely deleted in the bilingual edition of *The Golden Louts*, a five-volume set with a total of 2,587 pages under the series of Library of Chinese Classics published by the People's Literature Publishing House in 2008.<sup>16</sup>

There is no scholarly essay discussing "the juicy parts" of Egerton's and Roy's translations. This paper tries to be the first of its kind to compare Egerton's and Roy's translations of pornographic descriptions in *Jin Ping Mei*. I choose three important translated descriptions of sexual activity between Chapter 1 and 40, both from Egerton's and from Roy's translations, and compare their renditions with *Jin Ping Mei cihua*. These three juicy parts are representative of and crucial to understanding Ximen Qing's sexual life. The descriptions include Ximen Qing's first intercourse with Pan

pp. 412-24, Hong Tao, "Lun *Jin Ping Mei cihua* de shuangguanyu he kuawenhua fanyi wenti" 〈論《金瓶梅詞話》的雙關語和跨文化翻譯問題〉 in Luo Xuanmin 羅選民 ed., *Yuyan renzhi yu fanyi yanjiu* 《語言認知與翻譯研究》(Beijing: Waiwen chubanshe, 2005), pp. 251-61, Hong Tao, "*Jin Ping Mei cihua* zhong shuangguanyu, xinueyu, hunxiaohua de zuoyong jiqi Yingyi wenti" 〈《金瓶梅詞話》中雙關語、戲謔語、葷笑話的作用及其英譯問題〉 in *Jin Ping Mei wenhua yanji* 《金瓶梅文化研究》 vol. 5 (Beijing: Qunyan chubanshe, 2007), pp. 345-65, and Wen Xiuying 溫秀穎 and Zhang Yan 張雁, "Gainian yinyu kuangjia xia *Jin Ping Mei* liangge Yingyiben bijiao yanjiu," 〈概念隱喻框架下《金瓶梅》兩個英譯本比較研究〉 *Hebei luyou zhiye xueyuan xuebao* 《河北旅遊職業學院學報》17.1 (2011): 76-9.

<sup>16</sup> Langling xiaoxiaosheng 蘭陵笑笑生, *Jin Ping Mei The Golden Lotus* 《金瓶梅 The Golden Lotus》 Clement Egerton trans. 5 vols (Beijing: Renmin wenxue chubanshe, 2008). I use this edition for quoting Egerton's translation in this essay.

Jinlian in Chapter 4, the famous sex game under the grape arbor in Chapter 27, and Ximen Qing's first intercourse and anal sex with Wang Liuer in Chapter 37 and 38.

### First Appearance of Ximen Qing's Penis and Pan Jinlian's Vagina

The first explicit description of sexual activity in *Jin Ping Mei* takes place in Chapter 4 in which Ximen Qing commits adultery with Pan Jinlian for the first time with old woman Wang's assistance. After drinking much wine, Ximen Qing took his penis out and asked Pan Jinlian to play it with her hands. The author uses a poem to describe Ximen Qing's penis after a short introduction:

少頃吃得酒濃，不覺烘動春心，西門慶色心輒起，露出腰間那話，引婦人纖手捫弄。原來西門慶自幼常在三街四巷養婆娘，根下猶帶著銀打就，藥煮成的托子。那話煞甚長大，紅赤赤黑須，直豎豎堅硬，好個東西：

一物從來六寸長，有時柔軟有時剛。  
軟如醉漢東西倒，硬似風僧上下狂。  
出牝入陰為本事，腰州臍下作家鄉。  
天生二子隨身便，曾與佳人鬥幾場。<sup>17</sup>

Egerton and Roy take different approaches to translate the above lines. The English word "penis" which is equivalent to the Chinese word *nahua* 那話 in the original text does not appear in Egerton's translation. He eu-

<sup>17</sup> Langling Xiaoxiaosheng 蘭陵笑笑生, *Jin Ping Mei cihua* 《金瓶梅詞話》(Beijing: Renmin wenxue chubanshe, 1992), p. 35. I use this edition for quoting the Chinese text of *Jin Ping Mei* in this essay.



phemistically uses “the treasure” for *nahua* and “a mighty warrior” for *haoge dongxi* 好個東西 to refer to the same object instead :

Soon they had drunk as much as they desired, and a fit of passion swept over them. Hsi-mên Ch’ing’s desire could no longer be restrained; he disclosed the treasure which sprang from his loins, and made the woman touch it with her delicate fingers. From his youth upwards he had constantly played with the maidens who live in places of ill-fame, and he was already wearing the silver clasp which had been washed with magic herbs. Upstanding, it was, and flushed with pride, the black hair strong and bristling. A mighty warrior in very truth.

A warrior of stature not to be despised  
 At times a hero and at times a coward.  
 Who, when for battle disinclined,  
 As though in drink sprawls to the east and west.  
 But, when for combat he is ready,  
 Like a mad monk he plunges back and forth  
 And to the place from which he came returns.  
 Such is his duty.  
 His home is in the loins, beneath the navel.  
 Heaven has given him two sons  
 To go wherever he goes  
 And, when he meets an enemy worthy of his steel,  
 He will attack, and then attack again.<sup>18</sup>

The word “penis” does not occur in Roy’s translation, either. He seems

<sup>18</sup> Egerton, vol. 1, p 121.

to dodge translating this word and uses a very neutral and unerotic term “organ” twice for *nahua* and “object” for *haoge dongxi* :

In a little while, when they had both had enough wine to :

Ignite the flames of desires,

Hsi-men Ch’ing’s lustful thoughts got the better of him. Exposing the organ that lay between his loins, he induced the woman to manipulate it with her slender fingers.

It so happens that ever since his youth Hsi-men Ch’ing had frequented the streets and alleys of the licensed quarter and patronized the women who dwelt there. About the base of his member he wore a clasp that had been :

Beaten out of silver, and

Imbrued with drugs,

which had the effect of making that organ both large and long. It was :

Dark red, with black whiskers;

Straight standing, firm, and hard;

a fine object, indeed! There is a poem about its characteristics that testifies to this :

There is an object that has always been about six inches long;

Sometimes it is soft and at other times it is hard.

When soft, like a drunkard, it falls down either to the east or the west;

When hard, like a mad monk, it runs amok either above or below.

It makes it’s [its] living by traveling in and out of virgin territory;

It makes its home beneath that navel in the Province of the Loins.

It has two sons who always accompany it wherever it goes;

In how many skirmishes, with how many beauties, has it emerged the victor?<sup>19</sup>

If we compare Egerton's and Roy's translated pomes, we will find that Egerton's objective is to make his readers imagine that Ximen Qing has an admiring, brave, competitive, and heroic penis. He does not literally translate the size of Ximen Qing penis, *liucun chang* 六寸長, as six inches long, because that size is unimpressive for readers. What Egerton emphasizes on this poem is to compare Ximen Qing's penis to a combat soldier who fearlessly fights against his enemy in the battlefield. On the contrary, Roy's translated poem is more like a riddle and the bravery of Ximen Qing's penis in combat seems to be lost, especially when his translation ends with a question mark. The third person pronoun "it" appears ten times and the third person possessive pronoun "its" appears twice in this short poem. The repetition of it makes the poem less poetic.

Immediately after the description of Ximen Qing's penis, the author uses food imagery to describe Pan Jinlian's vagina and adds a poem to characterize it.

少頃，婦人脫了衣裳。西門慶摸見牝戶上並無毳毛，猶如白馥馥、鼓蓬蓬發酵的饅頭，軟濃濃、紅綳綳出籠的果餡，真個是千人愛萬人貪一件美物：  
溫緊香乾口賽蓮，能柔能軟最堪憐。  
喜便吐舌開顏笑，困便隨身貼股眠。  
內襠縣裏為家業，薄草涯邊是故園。

<sup>19</sup> Roy, vol. 1, pp. 90-1.

若遇風流輕俊子，等閒戰鬥不開言。<sup>20</sup>

The author uses *mantou* 饅頭, steamed bun, and *guoxian* 果餡, fruit stuffing, to emphasize the exquisites and taste of Pan Jinlian's vagina. By using "fresh-made pastry" and "a new made-pie," Egerton rightly catches the power of food imagery of the original.

Then Golden Lotus took off her clothes. Hsi-mên Ch'ing' fondled the fragrant blossom. No down concealed it; it had all the fragrance and tenderness of fresh-made pastry, the softness and the appearance of a new-made pie.<sup>21</sup>

Roy translates the same lines differently. He uses four pairs of adjectives without nouns and the focus of food imagery of the original is completely lost.

It was not long before the woman had taken off her clothes and Hsi-men Ch'ing discovered, by both visual and tactile means, that her mount of Venus had been depilated of its pubic hair. It was :

Palm and fragrant,  
Plump to bursting,  
Soft and yielding,  
Red and wrinkly,  
Tight and squeezy;  
Beloved of thousands,  
Craved by tens of thousands;

<sup>20</sup> Langling Xiaoxiaosheng, p. 15.

<sup>21</sup> Egerton, vol. 1, p. 121-3.

Who could tell what it might be?<sup>22</sup>

As far as the vagina poem is concerned, Egerton translates as :

Tender and clinging, with lips like lotus petals  
 Yielding and gentle, worthy to be loved.  
 When it is happy, it puts forth its tongue  
 And welcomes with a smile.  
 When it is weary, it is content  
 To stay there Nature put it  
 At home in Trouser Village  
 Among the scanty herbage.  
 But, when it meets a handsome gallant  
 It strives with him and says no word.<sup>23</sup>

Unlike the characteristics of preemptive strike expressed in the last two lines of Egerton's translation, Roy's description of Pan Jinlian's vagina seems less active and aggressive. He translates :

Warm and tight, fragrant and dry, it tastes  
 better than lotus root;  
 It knows how to be soft and yielding and to  
 make itself agreeable.  
 When happy, it sticks out its tongue, opens  
 its mouth, and smiles;  
 When tired, it collapsed lazily into itself  
 and takes a nap.

<sup>22</sup> Roy, vol. 1, p. 91.

<sup>23</sup> Egerton, vol. 1, p. 123.

The name of the place it makes its home  
 is Crotch County;  
 Its old garden is to be found beside the  
 sparsely wooded slopes.  
 If it should ever encounter a dashing  
 young gentleman;  
 It will engage him in battle, without a word,  
 on the slightest pretext.<sup>24</sup>

Egerton uses warrior-like image to describe Ximen Qing's penis in Chapter 13 in which Pan Jinlian asked whether Ximen Qing committed adultery with Li Pinger the other night and checked his penis. When Ximen Qing went to Pan Jinlian's room in the morning, Pan Jinlian :

說著一隻手把他褲子扯開，只見那話軟釘當，銀托子還帶在上面，問道：「你實說，與淫婦弄了幾遭？」西門慶道：「弄到有數兒的，只一遭。」婦人道：「你賭個誓，一遭就弄的他恁軟如鼻涕濃如醬，卻如風癱了一般的！有些硬朗氣兒也是人心。」說著把托子一揪，掛下來，罵道：「沒羞的強盜，嗔道教我那裏沒尋，原來把這行貨子悄悄地帶出，和那淫婦禽搗去了。」<sup>25</sup>

She pulled down Hsi-mên's trousers and perceived that the warrior seemed anything but ready for the strife, though he still wore his silver armour. "Tell me the truth," she cried, "how many times has this fellow returned to the attack?" "That is an easy question to answer," Hsi-mên said. "Once was enough for him," "Will you

<sup>24</sup> Roy, vol. 1, p. 91.

<sup>25</sup> Langling Xiaoxiaosheng, p. 106.

swear that it was only once?" Golden Lotus said. "Why should he be so dejected, then? He seems half paralyzed. If he showed the slightest sign of courage, I might credit his master with some manly qualities at least." She stripped the warrior of his armour, and cursed him. "You abandoned scoundrel. There cannot be another like you in all the world. You take this thing with you on the sly when you go to play with that wicked creature."<sup>26</sup>

Egerton translates *nahua* as "the warrior" again and refers Ximen Qing's intercourse with Li Pinger to "the attack." To match the warrior-like image of Ximen Qing's penis, Egerton translates *yin tuozi* 銀托子 as silver armour to be the warrior's military accessory instead of silver clasp which he uses in Chapter 4. Roy translates the above lines more literally than Egerton does :

As she spoke, she pulled open his trousers with one hand, exposing to view his limp and flaccid organ, which still had a silver clasp fastened around it. "Tell me the truth," she demanded. "How many times did you make out with that whore last night?" "Only once that would really count," applied Hsi-men Ch'ing. "You'll have to swear an oath on that all too vigorous body of yours before you can get me to believe that," said the woman. "One time only and it's :

As soft as driveling snot and thick as gravy.

It might as well have been stricken with paralysis. The slightest sign of vitality would be cause for hope." As she spoke, she removed the clasp with a single motion of her hand, and continued

<sup>26</sup> Egerton, vol. 1, p. 319.

to berate him, saying, "You shameless ruffian."<sup>27</sup>

Egerton's phallic and sexual metaphors of warrior and his attack are replaced by a more plain diction, for example, "organ" and "make out."

### The Famous Chapter 27

One of the most famous pornographic chapters in *Jin Ping Mei* is Chapter 27 in which Pan Jinlian engages in a drunken orgy under the grape arbor. To analyze Egerton's and Roy's translations of this juicy part, it is necessary to quote the long passages. When Ximen Qing saw Pan Jinlian lying naked on the mat in the garden, his desire was aroused.

西門慶看見，怎不觸動淫心，於是剩著酒興，亦脫去上下衣，坐在一涼墩上，先將腳指挑弄其花心，挑的淫津流出，如蝸之吐涎。一面又將婦人紅繡花鞋兒摘取下來，戲把他兩條腳帶解下來，拴其雙足，吊在兩邊葡萄架兒上，如金龍探爪相似，使牝戶大張，紅鈎赤露，雞舌內吐。西門慶先倒覆著身子，執塵柄抵牝口，賣了個倒入翎花，一手據枕，極力而提之，提的陰中淫氣連綿，如數鰍行泥淖中相似。婦人在下沒口子呼叫達達不絕。<sup>28</sup>

Egerton translates the above as :

When Hsi-mên Ch'ing saw her, his wanton heart was quickly stirred, for the wine had not been without its effect upon him. He took off his clothes, and sat down on a stool, letting his toes play around the treasure of this beautiful flower. Then proof of her

<sup>27</sup> Roy, vol. 1, p. 270.

<sup>28</sup> Langling Xiaoxiaosheng, p. 231.

pleasure oozed from her like the slime of a snail leaving its tortuous white trail. Hsi-mên pulled off her decorated crimson shoes, loosened the ribbons that bounded her feet and tied her ankles to the trellis, so that she looked like a golden dragon baring its claws. The gate of womanhood was open, its guardian was aroused, and a deep scarlet vale appeared. Hsi-mên Ch'ing lay down and, taking his weapon in his hands, prepared to storm the breach, resting one hand upon the pillow, and proceeding to the attack as he had played "Feathers through the Arch" when at the Flying Arrow game. He strove with all his strength, till from the scene of combat a mist arose, spiraling, like an eel rising from the mud. Golden Lotus beneath him never ceased to murmur, "Daring, my darling."<sup>29</sup>

In Egerton's translation the anatomical names of Pan Jinlian's private area never occur. He translates *huaxin* 花心 as "the treasure of this beautiful flower" referring to Pan Jinlian's clitoris. He uses "proof of her pleasure" to represent her vaginal fluids. Her vagina and its lips are rhetorically and artistically changed into "the gate of womanhood" and "its guardian." As far as Ximen Qing is concerned, Egerton consistently uses phallic metaphor of brave combat soldier for penis. Ready to conquer the enemy, Ximen Qing took "his weapon," "prepared to storm the breach," and proceeded "to attack."

Roy uses physiological terms to describe Pan Jinlian's vaginal changes during her sexual arousal. The following passages are his translation :

Thereupon, exhilarated by the wine, he took off his own clothes,

<sup>29</sup> Egerton, vol. 2, p. 653.

above and below, at down on a cool porcelain taboret, and started out by titillating her clitoris with his toe. He titillated it to such effect that her vaginal fluids began to flow, like a snail secreting its slime. He then took off the woman's red embroidered shoes, unwound her foot bindings, and amused himself by using them to suspend her two feet from the grape arbor overhead, so that she looked just like "A Golden Dragon Extending Its Claws." As a result :

Her vaginal orifice was greatly distended,

Her "Red Hook" was completely exposed, and

Her "Chicken Tongue" protruded from within.

Hsi-men Ch'ing started out by stooping over her and placing his jade chowrie handle inside the mouth of her vagina, thus demonstrating the position known as "Inserting the Arrow Upside Down." Supporting himself with one hand on her pillow, he proceeded to thrust with all his strength. He continued to thrust until her vaginal secretions flowed uninterruptedly, making a sound like a school of loaches plunging through the mud. The woman, from underneath, inarticulately called out, "Daddy!" unceasingly.<sup>30</sup>

He translates *huaxin* 花心 directly as clitoris. Vagina and its adjective, vaginal, appear many times in Roy's translation, for example, vagina for *pinhu* 牝戶, vaginal fluid for *yinjin* 淫津, vaginal orifice for *pinkou* 牝口, and vaginal secretions for *yin zhong yinqi* 陰中淫氣. In the following scene Ximen Qing encountered Chun Mei and invited her to watch him play the sex game "pitching into the fleshly pot." The narrator describes

<sup>30</sup> Roy, vol. 2, p. 144.

what happened :

於是向冰碗內取了枚玉黃李子，向婦人牝中，一連打了三個，皆中花心。這西門慶一連吃了三鍾藥五香酒，旋令春梅斟了一鍾兒，遞與婦人吃。又把一個李子放在牝內，不取出來，又不行事，急的婦人春心沒亂，淫水直流。只是朦朧星眼，四肢軀然於枕簟之上，口中叫道：「好個作怪的冤家，捉弄奴死了。」鶯聲顫掉。<sup>31</sup>

Roy continues to use clitoris and vagina when translating the sex game.

Thereupon, he reached into the bowl of ice water for a jade-yellow "imperial damson" plum and pitched it at the orifice of the woman's vagina. He pitched three of these in a row and each of them struck the clitoris. Hsi-men Ch'ing accordingly downed three cups of the medicated Five Spice Wine. He also had Ch'un-mei pour a cup of wine and give it to the woman to drink. Hsi-men Ch'ing then inserted a damson plum into the woman's vagina and neither removed it nor proceeded to any further action, which had the effect of arousing the woman until :

Her amorous desires were in a tumult, and

Her vaginal fluids began to overflow,

but she was too embarrassed to call out. Instead :

Her starry eyes grew dim, and

Her four limbs lay inert upon pillow and mat.

Finally she called out :

<sup>31</sup> Langling Xiaoxiaosheng, p. 232.

Her oriole's voice all aquaver,

"What a cruel lover! You'll do me to death yet."<sup>32</sup>

He translated *pinzhong* 牝中 into "the orifice of vagina," *pinnei* 牝內 into "vagina," and *yinshui* 淫水 into "vaginal fluids." Roy hardly uses alternative words to replace vagina and nor does he use figure of speech to describe it. Of the same passages, Egerton avoids direct terms to refer to Pan Jinlian's clitoris and vagina. He translates as :

He took a plum from the iced bowl, and cast it to the gate of womanhood, Three times he cast; three times he reached the inmost flower. One plum stuck there, but he neither removed it nor finished the work he had begun until the girl became faint and her distress from the effort was evident. Her starry eyes were half closed, and her body fell back limply upon the mat. "You are indeed a roughish enemy," she murmured. "You will be the death of me." Her voice trembled.<sup>33</sup>

To avoid using "the treasure of beautiful flower" repeatedly, Egerton chooses "the inmost flower" to represent *huaxin* this time. Like what Egerton has translated in the previous passages, the word "vagina" does not occur in the above translation at all.

Ximen Qing took a nap after playing the game and when he woke up he had violent sex with Pan Jinlian. The author spends a lot of inks describing their foreplay and intercourse.

由著西門慶睡了一個時辰，睜開眼醒來，看見婦人還吊在架

<sup>32</sup> Roy, vol. 2, pp. 145-6.

<sup>33</sup> Egerton, vol. 2, pp. 655-7.

上，兩隻白生生腿兒蹺在兩邊，興不可遏。因見春梅不在跟前，向婦人道：「淫婦，我丟與你罷。」

於是先摳出牝中李子，教婦人吃了。坐在一隻枕頭上，向紗褶子順帶內取出淫器包兒來，使上銀托子，次用硫黃圈束著根子，初時不肯深入，只在牝口子來回播晃，急的婦人仰身迎播，口中不住聲叫：「達達！快些進去罷，急壞了淫婦了，我曉的你惱我，為李瓶兒故意使這促恰來奈何我，今日經著你手段，再不敢惹你了。」西門慶笑道：「小淫婦兒！你知道就好說話兒了。」於是一壁幌著他心子，把那話拽出來，向袋中包兒裏打開，撚了些「閨豔聲嬌」塗在蛙口內，頂入牝中，送了幾送。須臾，那話昂健奢梭，暴怒起來，垂首玩著往來抽拽，玩其出入之勢。那婦人在枕畔，朦朧星眼，呻吟不已，沒口子叫：「大髡鬚達達，你不知使了甚麼行貨子進去。罷了，淫婦的愁心癢到骨髓裏去了。可憐見饒了罷。」淫婦口裏磣死的言語都叫了出來，這西門慶一上手，就是三四百回，兩只手倒按住枕席，仰身竭力迎播掀幹，抽沒至脛腹送至根者，又約一百餘下。婦人以怕不住在下抹拭牝中之津，隨拭隨出，衽席為之皆濕。西門慶行貨子，沒稜露腦，往來逗留不已。因向婦人說道：「我要耍個老和尚撞鐘。」忽然仰身望前只一送，那話攢進去了，直抵牝屋之上。牝屋者，乃婦人牝中深極處，有屋如含苞花蕊，到此處，男子莖首，覺翕然暢美不可言。婦人觸疼，急跨其身，只聽磕磕響了一聲，把個硫黃圈子折在裏面。<sup>34</sup>

Egerton translates the above lines as :

Hsi-mên slept for an hour or so, and when he opened his eyes.  
Golden Lotus's white legs were still hanging from the trellis.

<sup>34</sup> Langling Xiaoxiaosheng, p. 232-3.

Plum Blossom had gone. Again his passion was aroused. "Now, you abandoned little creature," he cried, "I'll attend to you." He took out the plum, and gave it her to eat. Then sitting on the pillow, he took from a pocket in his gown a case of love instruments. First, he put on the clasp, and tied a sulphur ring about the root of evil. He refused to dismount her, but played so long about her entrance that she cried in fury. "My darling, my dearest, be a man quickly or I shall go mad. I see what it is. You are angry with me because of the Lady of the Vase. That is why you tease me like this. But now I have found how cunning you can be, I will never make you angry again." "Ah," cried Hsi-mên, laughing, "so you have learned your lesson. Well, speak nicely to me." With one thrust he seemed to reach her inmost parts. Then he withdrew; searching in his pocket he found some of the powder which is called "Delight of the Bedroom and Fragrance of the Penis," and applied it to the frog's mouth. He returned to the attack, and immediately a tall, proud warrior appeared, full of fire and fury; Hsi-mên surveyed the struggle with admiration. She lay on the mat with half-closed eyes murmuring. "Oh my beloved darling! You don't know what you're putting into me. That thing has driven me to frenzy. Spare me, please." She spoke without shame, but Hsi-mên instantly drove forward with full strength, his hands on the mat, tearing and digging, plunging into her depths a hundred times before withdrawing again. She wiped her wounds with a handkerchief, but in vain; the mat bore clear traces of battle, and the warrior, still erect and fierce, would not desist. "The time has come," cried Hsi-mên, "the monk shall smite the timbrel." Suddenly he lunged, and

reached the inmost citadel; for within the gate of womanhood there lies a citadel, like the heart of a flower, which, if touched by the conqueror, is infused with a wonderful pleasure. She felt pain and withdrew; but the sulphur ring broke inside her body with a crack.<sup>35</sup>

Egerton describes Ximen Qing's erected penis as "a tall, proud warrior appeared, full of fire and fury" and the penis "returned to attack" after Ximen Qing applied some powder to his "frog's mouth." The blanket that Pan Jinlian sat on was soaked with her vaginal fluids. She was so wet that she had to wipe them "with a handkerchief, but in vain;" and the mat "bore clear traces of battle, and the warrior, still erect and fierce, would not desist." After hundreds of thrusting, the blanket which Pan Jin sat was like the site of a bloody battlefield. Egerton further describes the extreme pleasure Ximen Qing enjoyed. "Suddenly he lunged, and reached the inmost citadel; for within the gate of womanhood there lies a citadel, like the heart of a flower, which, if touched by the conqueror, is infused with a wonderful pleasure." Here we can find Egerton compares the penetrator to the conqueror and the penetrated to the conquered. The power structure of the intercourse is clearly revealed in Egerton's translation.

Roy translates this violent sex differently.

No one disturbed Hsi-men Ch'ing's nap, and he slept for about two hours before waking up. When he opened his eyes he saw that the woman's two fresh white legs were still splayed to either side as they hung suspended from the grape arbor overhead. Unable to restrain his lust, he noticed that Ch'un-mei was no longer in evi-

<sup>35</sup> Egerton, vol. 2, pp. 655-7.

dence and, turning to the woman, said, "All right, I'll let you have it now."

Thereupon, he first fished the damson plum out of her vagina and made the woman eat it. Then he sat down on a pillow, pulled the bag of sexual implements out of the wallet attached to his silk jacket, and fastened in place first the silver clasp and then the sulphur-imbrued ring. At first he only dallied back and forth in the mouth of her vagina, refusing to penetrate deeply, which had the effect of arousing the woman until she arched her back in response to his every movement, while crying out unceasingly, "Daddy, hurry up and get inside! You're driving this whore of yours crazy! I know you're upset with me on account of Li P'ing-erh and are deliberately pulling out the stops to teach me a lesson. After what you've put me through today, I won't dare defy you anymore." "You little whore," laughed Hsi-men Ch'ing, "as long as you understand what's what, we can negotiate the better."

Thereupon, after titillating her clitoris a little further, he withdrew his organ, opened the bag from his wallet, picked out a glob of the aphrodisiac ointment called "Amorous Cries of Boudoir Beauties" with his finger and thumb, and daubing it in the mouth of his urethra, plunged the object into her vagina and gave a few thrusts with it. In no time at all his organ became proud and firm.

Its protuberances swelled and its head sprang up, As it became engorged with rage. Hsi-men Ch'ing : Bent his head the better to observe, The coming and going, thrusting and retraction; Savoring the sight as it went in and out. As the woman lay beside the pillow: Her starry eyes grew dim, and She moaned incessantly, inarticu-



lately called out, "My big-dicked daddy! What are you up to? Go all the way in and be done wit it. The itch in the clitoris of the cunt of this whore of yours has entered into the marrow of her bones. Take pity on me and let me off for now." In the mouth of this whore no expression, no matter how unspeakably obscene, was left unsaid. As for Hsi-men Ch'ing, once he got started he was good for three or four hundred thrusts at a time. Supporting himself facedown on the pillow and mat with both hands, arching his back and exerting all his strength, responding to her movements and raising himself to the task, he retraced his organ as far as its neck and plunged it in all the way up to the root another hundred times or so. The woman, from underneath, used a napkin to wipe away her vaginal secretions, but they continued to flow, as a result of which the mat was completely soaked. Hsi-men Ch'ing alternately submerged and exposed the knob of his glans, moving back and forth and easing her without mercy. Turning to the woman, he said, "I'm going to demonstrate the position known as 'The Old Monk Rings the Dinner Bell.'"

All of a sudden, he arched his back and lunged forward, thrusting himself inside her until the tip of his organ penetrated all the way to her cervix. The cervix is the innermost recess of the vaginal chamber and contains a fleshy growth like the budding pistil of a flower. When the glans of his penis penetrates to this point without being deflected, the man will feel a melting sensation the pleasure of which is indescribable. The woman was hurt and responded with a sudden upward buck of her body, as a result of which, what could be heard but a cracking sound as the sulfur-imbrued ring

broke inside her.<sup>36</sup>

Roy describes how wet Pan Jinlian was using the following words: "The woman, from underneath, used a napkin to wipe away her vaginal secretions, but they continued to flow, as a result of which the mat was completely soaked." If we compare Roy's translation of Pan Jinlian's cleaning of her vaginal fluids with Egerton's translation, we will find that Roy's is less imaginative and it seems that Roy's translation, to some degree, is like a live porno broadcast transformed into a literal and descriptive form. We can also find such descriptive characteristics in Roy's translation of Ximen Qing's penis's in-and-out movements. For example, Ximen Qing "retraced his organ as far as its neck and plunged it in all the way up to the root another hundred times or so." He "alternately submerged and exposed the knob of his glans, moving back and forth and easing her without mercy." "All of a sudden, he arched his back and lunged forward, thrusting himself inside her until the tip of his organ penetrated all the way to her cervix."

### Ximen Qing and Wang Liuer in Chapter 37 and 38

There are long pornographic descriptions of the intercourse of Ximen Qing and Wang Liuer in Chapter 37 and 38 in which Ximen Qing seduced Wang Liuer and committed adultery with her twice. In Chapter 37, Ximen Qing sent Wang Liuer's husband Han Daoguo away and drank wine with her in her room.

婦人便舒手下邊，籠攓西門慶玉莖。彼此淫心蕩漾，把酒停住不吃了。掩上房門，褪去衣褲。婦人就在裏邊炕床上伸開被褥。那時已是日色平西時分。西門慶乘著酒興，順袋內取出銀托子

<sup>36</sup> Roy, vol. 2, pp. 147-8.

來使上。婦人用手打弄，見奢稜跳腦，紫強光鮮，沉甸甸甚是粗大。一壁坐在西門慶懷裏，一面在上，兩個且摟著脖子親嘴。婦人乃蹺起一足，以手導那話入牝中，兩個挺一回。西門慶摸見婦人肌膚柔膩，牝毛疏秀，先令婦人仰臥於床背，把雙手提其雙足，置之於腰眼間，肆行抽送。怎見得這場雲雨？但見：威風迷翠榻，殺氣瑣鴛衾。珊瑚枕上施雄，翡翠帳中鬥勇。男兒氣急，使槍只去紮心窩；女帥心忙，開口要來吞腦袋。一個使雙炮的，往來攻打內襠兵；一個輪傍牌的，上下夾迎臍下將。一個金雞獨立，高蹺玉腿弄精神；一個枯樹盤根，倒入翎花來刺牝。戰良久朦朧星眼，但動些兒麻上來；鬥多時款擺纖腰，百戰百回挨不去。散毛洞主倒上橋，放水去淹軍；烏甲將軍虛點槍，側身逃命走。臍膏落馬，須臾蹂踏肉為泥；溫緊妝呆，頃刻跌翻深澗底。大披掛七零八斷，猶如急雨打殘花；錦套頭力盡筋輸，恰似猛風飄敗葉。硫黃元帥，盔歪甲散走無門；銀甲將軍，守住老營還要命。正是：愁雲托上九重天，一塊敗兵連地滾。<sup>37</sup>

Egerton's translates the above lines as :

She took the jade scepter into her hand. Their passions were stirred into flame. They drank no more, but saw to the fastenings upon the door. Then both took off their clothes, and the woman prepared to coverlets upon the bed. It was the hour before sunset. The wine had set Hsi-mên Ch'ing on fire. He took the silver clasp from its case, and put it in position, while the woman fondly touched him with her slender hands. She though his weapon looked magnificent; the veins swelled with dark red blood, and the flesh was firm and

powerful. She sat on his knees; they threw their arms round each other's necks, and kissed again. Then she raised one of her legs, and, with her hand, helped that sword to find its scabbard. For a while, they jostled together. Hsi-mên Ch'ing allowed his hands to wander over the woman's body. It was very soft but firm. The hair was fine and delicate. Eventually he told her to lie on the bed; he pulled her legs around his body and throw himself fiercely into the struggle.

The god of battle now holds sway over the green-clad bed.

The coverlets, with silk-embroidered love birds, feel the press of strife.

Heroes display their prowess on the coral pillows

Striving for victory within the silken curtains.

The hero dashes madly to the fray, plunges his spear with fury home.

The heroine's heart beats wildly. She yawns and gapes and fain would all devour him.

Then up he brings his pair of culverins, and lets them loose upon the enemy skulking in the trousers.

The other raises her shield to meet the mad attack of the great general stationed beneath the navel.

One plays the golden cockerel, standing on single leg, raising the other high, to show his mettle

The other, like a stripped tree, with roots that spread in all directions, thrusts forth to meet the foe.

When they have fought a while, the shining eyes are dimmed

A single movement makes them squirm and quiver.

<sup>37</sup> Langling Xiaoxiaosheng, p. 323-4.

Though their limbs tremble, they cannot break away.  
 Then, letting loose the dam, the captain of the scanty hair would  
 drown his enemy in the flood.  
 The general in black armour feigns to make a thrust, but turns  
 aside and seeks to fly.  
 The warden of the navel is unhorsed, thrown down and ground to  
 dust in but a moment.  
 Lord 'warm and tight' now plays the fool, tumbling the falls to the  
 far depths of the abyss.  
 The heavy mail is broken into pieces, like faded blossoms when  
 the storm breaks on them  
 The silken cap gives way beneath the strains, like fallen leaves  
 before the raging winds  
 And Marshal 'sulphurous,' his crest awry, can find on place to flee.  
 Prince 'Silver Armour' holds his ground, and swears he'll stand till  
 death.  
 The skies are hidden by a sad dark cloud  
 The warrior roll stricken on the field.<sup>38</sup>

Egerton translates *yujing* 玉莖, a metaphor for Ximen Qing's penis, as "the jade scepter," and describes what Ximen Qing's erected penis looked like when Wang Liuer saw it for the first time. "[H]is weapon looked magnificent; the veins swelled with dark red blood, and the flesh was firm and powerful." Roy translates the same lines with a verse style.

Its protuberances swelled and its head sprang up,  
 It became empurpled and shiny,

<sup>38</sup> Egerton, vol. 2, pp. 913-5.

Tumid, and extremely thick.<sup>39</sup>

Additionally, the long poem records the intense intercourse performed by Ximen Qing and Wang Liuer. Both are transformed into hero and heroine as enemies in battlefield. The hero is hostile to the heroine and tries to conquer her territory. "The hero dashes madly to the fray, plunges his spear with fury home. The heroine's heart beats wildly. She yawns and gapes and fain would all devour him." Egerton's translation of the battle is quite faithful to the original. He translates the four sets of attacking and defending actions in the battle as the following words and does not write any notes for his readers.

Then up he brings his pair of culverins, and lets them loose upon  
 the enemy skulking in the trousers.  
 The other raises her shield to meet the mad attack of the great general  
 stationed beneath the navel.  
 One plays the golden cockerel, standing on single leg, raising the  
 other high, to show his mettle  
 The other, like a stripped tree, with roots that spread in all directions,  
 thrusts forth to meet the foe.

Roy translates the poem differently. He uses a lot of allusions that are not in the original poem and puts a lot of long and tiresome notes to explain his readers where these allusions come from and what they mean. He translates the four sets of attacking and defending actions in the battle as the following words :

One comes, the other goes;

<sup>39</sup> Roy, vol. 2, p. 373.

As An Lu-shan consorts with  
 Yan Kuei-fei.  
 One butts, the other lunges;  
 As Chang Chü-jui makes up to  
 Ts'ui Ying-ying.  
 To left and right they join together;  
 In the Milk Way the Weaving Maid  
 meet the Herd Boy.  
 Above and below they coil about;  
 In the fairy cave the immortal maiden  
 confronts Juan Chao.  
 The spear comes, the bucklers bear the brunt;  
 Ts'ui Huai-pao unites himself with  
 Hsüeh Ch'iung-ch'iung.  
 The ballista attacks, the blade fends it off;  
 Shuang Chien conjoins himself with  
 Su Hsiao-ch'ing.  
 This one gives vent to the warbling of an oriole;  
 It much resembles Wu Tse-t'ien's rendezvous  
 with Hsüeh Ao-ts'ao.  
 That one gives voice to the twittering of a swallow;  
 It is just like Shen I-chi's consorting  
 With Empress Lü<sup>40</sup>

Roy adds fifteen mythological and historical figures and 8 long notes to translate these actions. To explain the unification of Ts'ui Huai-pao and

<sup>40</sup> Roy, vol. 2, pp. 376-7.

Hsüeh Ch'iung-ch'ing to his readers, Roy writes in a note :

According to a story dating from the eleventh century or earlier, a young scholar name Ts'ui Huai-pao, on the Ch'ing-ming Festival in the year 754, fell in love with a psaltery player from the palace orchestra name Hsüeh Ch'iung-ch'iung when he chanced to see her on a spring outing. They eloped together, and were later apprehended but were pardoned by Emperor Hsüan-tsung, who gave Hsüeh Ch'iung-ch'iung to Ts'ui Huai-pao in marriage. See *Sung Yüan hsi-wen chi-i*, p. 136.<sup>41</sup>

Another long note describes the allusion of Shen I-chi's consorting with Empress Lü. Roy explains :

Shen I-chi (d. 177 B.C.) is a historical figure who rose to the rank of left counselor-in-chief as a favorite of Empress Lü (242-180 B.C.) of the Former Han dynasty, with whom he became intimate after the death of Emperor Kao-tsu (r. 202-195 B.C.) in 195 B.C. On Empress Lü, see Roy, *The Plum in the Golden Vase*, chap. 1, n. 21. On the nature of her relations with Shen I-chi, see *Shih-chi*, vol. 8 *chüan* 97, pp. 2702-2703; and *Records of the Grand Historian of China*, trans. Burton Watson, 2 vols. (New York: Columbia University Press, 1961), 1 : 282.<sup>42</sup>

Roy's endeavor to offer as much explanation and background information as possible for his readers to understand this poem can be said to be technically more accurate and intellectually more knowledgeable than

<sup>41</sup> *Ibid.*, p. 559.

<sup>42</sup> *Ibid.*

Egerton. But the question is : When reading this poem, how many readers *actually* turn to the note page and patiently read the information, not just for one note, but the whole eight long notes?

Wang Liuer is obsessed with fellatio and anal sex when having sex. And there are some long passages of her performing oral and anal sex with Ximen Qing in Chapter 37 and 38. The narrator explains Wang Liuer's two special preference in bed :

原來婦人有一件毛病，但凡交媾，只要教漢子幹他後庭花，在下邊揉著心子繞過。不然隨問怎的不得丟身子。就是韓道國與他相合，倒是後邊去的多，前邊一月走不的兩三遭兒。第二件，積年好啞髭鬚，把髭鬚常遠放在口裏，一夜他也無個足處。隨問怎的出了毬，禁不的他吮舔挑弄，登時就起。<sup>43</sup>

Egerton translates the above lines as :

Porphyry liked one game more than any other. When she had joined with him as lovers do, she wanted him to enjoy the flower in her bottom while she played with the flower in her womb. Satisfied in this way she reached the blissful oblivion which is the aim of lovers. She used to practise this game so often that in thirty days Han Tao-kuo would take his pleasure at the front gate no more than three times. Apart from this she titillated his ivory scepter with her lips and fondled it all night with never-failing desire; if its master flagged, her lips returned his strength.<sup>44</sup>

Instead of using the most common-known term anal sex, Egerton

<sup>43</sup> Langling Xiaoxiaosheng, p. 324.

<sup>44</sup> Egerton, vol. 2, pp. 915.

translates *houtinghua* 後庭花 literally into “the flower in her bottom” which makes the act poetic and artistic. Instead of translating the derogatory words *haoza jiba* 好啞髭鬚 of the original into “being fond of sucking cock,” Egerton skillfully translates these words as “titillated his ivory scepter with her lips.” Unlike Egerton, Roy treats Wang Liuer's fondness of anal and anal sex as suffering and malady. He translates the same text as :

It so happens that the woman suffered from a malady. Whenever she engaged in sexual intercourse she required her partner to pluck the flower in her rear courtyard, while she stimulated her clitoris below, before she was able to experience orgasm. If not, no matter what happened, she could not come. Even when Han Tao-kuo engaged in intercourse with her, he approached her by the rear entry more often than not, coming in by the front door no more than two or three times a month. A second malady of hers was that she was inveterately fond of sucking cock. She would keep it in her mouth for the longest time, even all night along, without being satisfied. No matter how much spunk her partner may have ejaculated, once subjected to her sucking and titillation, his member would re-erect itself forthwith.

Roy translates *houtinghua* as “the flower in her rear courtyard.” But he takes the term *houtinghua* too literally and uses the verb “plunk” for performing it. As for *haoza jiba*, Roy translates as “fond of sucking cock.”

Pornographic descriptions of the intercourse between Ximen Qing and Wang Liuer continue in Chapter 38 in which Wang Liuer's performances of oral and anal sex are emphasized. The narrator describes how Ximen Qing used sex toys to please Wang Liuer in great details.

家中袖了一個錦包兒來，打開，裏面銀托子、相思套、硫黃圈、藥煮的白綾帶子、懸玉環、封臍膏、勉鈴，一弄兒淫器。那婦人仰臥枕上，玉腿高蹺，口舌內吐。西門慶先把勉鈴教婦人自放牝內，然後將銀托束其根，硫黃圈套其首，臍膏貼於臍上。婦人以手導入牝中，兩相迎湊，漸入大半。婦人呼道：「達達！我只怕你墩的腿酸，拿過枕頭來，你墊著坐，我淫婦自家動罷。」又道：「只怕你不自在，你把淫婦腿吊著合，你看好不好？」西門慶真個把他腳帶解下一條來，拴他一足，吊在床榻子上低著拽，<sup>45</sup>

Egerton translates their foreplay with sex toys as :

In his sleeve he had a silken kerchief. He opened it. Inside were a silver clasp, a lover's cap, a sulphur ring, a white silk ribbon with medicinal properties, and all manner of things for increasing passion. Porphyry set her head upon the pillow. She lifted her ivory-white legs to show her cock's tongue. Hsi-mên asked whether he could put his medicine into it; he attached the silver clasp to the root of his penis, added the sulphur ring and smeared his belly with ointment from the navel downwards. She grasped his treasure and put it deep inside her, embracing him hard and long. "Are your legs tired?" said Porphyry. "Hold the bed; I'll move my body." And again, "I hope you're not in pain. Shouldn't I lift my legs higher?" Hsi-mên tied her leg to the bed and pressed down with his body.<sup>46</sup>

<sup>45</sup> Langling Xiaoxiaosheng, p. 329.

<sup>46</sup> Egerton, vol. 2, pp. 929.

The narrator describes how she cleaned her vaginal fluids by licking with her tongue.

拽的婦人牝中之津如蝸之吐涎，綿綿不絕，又拽出好些白漿子來。西門慶問道：「你如何流這些白？」才待要抹去，婦人道：「你休抹，等我吮咂了罷。」於是蹲跪在他面前吮吞數次，嗚啞有聲。<sup>47</sup>

Egerton translates Wang Liuer's *pinzhong zhi jin* 牝中之津, vaginal fluids, as "the juice of love."

The juice of love flowed continually from her body like snail's slime. Something white came out too. And Hsi-mên asked, "Why have you got so much of this?" He was about to clean himself, but Porphyry said, "Wait, I'll clean you in my own way," knelt down and licked him clean with her sensuous tongue.<sup>48</sup>

Roy translated the same passages as :

Thereupon he lowered his head and proceeded to thrust and retract until her vaginal fluids began to flow uninterruptedly, like a snail secreting its slime. In the process of retracting, a good deal of white discharge emerged. "Why are you producing this white discharge?" Hsi-men Ch'ing asked. He was about to wipe himself off when the woman said, "Don't wipe it off. Let me suck it for you." Thereupon, she squatted down in front of him and lapped it up so thoroughly that :

<sup>47</sup> Langling Xiaoxiaosheng, pp. 329.

<sup>48</sup> Egerton, vol. 2, pp. 929.

The sound of her sucking was audible.

This so affected Hsi-men Ch'ing that his :

Lecherous desires were suddenly aroused.<sup>49</sup>

Here Roy translates Wang Liuer's *pinzhong zhi jin* as "vaginal fluids" and literally translates *baijiangzi* 白漿子 as "white discharge." Egerton does not translate Wang Liuer's *baijiangzi* but simply uses "so much of this" to refer it.

After that Ximen Qing and Wang Liuer had anal sex and the narrator describes :

啞的西門慶淫心輒起，吊過身子，兩個幹後庭花。龜頭上有硫黃圈，濡研難澀。婦人蹙眉隱忍，半晌僅沒其稜。西門慶頗作抽送，而婦人用手摸之，漸入大半，把屁股坐在西門慶懷裏，回首流眸，作顫聲叫：「達達！慢著些，後越發粗大，教淫婦怎生挨忍。」西門慶且扶起股，觀其出入之勢，……兩個幹勾一頓飯時。西門慶令婦人沒高低淫聲浪語叫著才過。婦人在下，一面用手舉股承受其精，樂極情濃，一泄如注。已而抽出那話來，帶著圈子，婦人還替他吮啞淨了，兩個方才並頭交股而臥。正是：一般滋味美，好耍後庭花。

有詞為證：

美冤家，一心愛折後庭花。尋常只在門前裏走，又被開路先鋒把住了他。放在戶中難禁受。轉絲韁勒回馬，親得勝弄的我身上麻，蹴損了奴的粉臉那丹霞。<sup>50</sup>

The following lines are Egerton's translation of their anal sex.

<sup>49</sup> Roy, vol. 2, p. 388.

<sup>50</sup> Langling Xiaoxiaosheng, pp. 329-30.

Then Hsi-mên, again fired with desire, turned her over and started on the flower in her bottom. But the sulphur on her penis proved sticky, so progress was difficult and she grimaced with pain. He made little headway, and Porphyry, feeling about with her hand, found that he had gone only halfway. She turned round and said, with a winning look, "Darling, please go in slowly. The root of your prick is bigger than I can take." Hsi-mên lifted his legs so that he could see himself going in and out.....They talked and sported together for a long time. "Unless you speak lovingly to me," Hsi-mên said at last, "I will not yield to you." The Porphyry raised herself upon her hands to receive the stream of life. Hsi-mên had such an orgasm that he liquid flowed like a torrent. He withdrew, still wearing the ring. Porphyry washed him orally, and they lay down on the bed together.<sup>51</sup>

Egerton skips the *ci* in the last part of above passages. In Roy's translation, he writes :

Turning her over, he set out, with her cooperation, to pluck the flower in her rear courtyard. His turtle head was encumbered with the sulfur-imbrued ring so that, even with moistening and reaming, it was difficult to proceed. The woman knit her brows and silently endured the pain for some time before he succeeded in immersing the knob of his glans. Hsi-men Ch'ing thereupon began to thrust and retract in earnest, while the woman rubbed his organ with her hand until :

It gradually penetrated more than halfway.

<sup>51</sup> Egerton, vol. 2, pp. 929-31.

Parking her posterior in Hsi-men Ch'ing's lap, and :  
 Turning her head around with an amorous glance,  
 she said, in a quavery voice, "Daddy! Slow down a bit. The  
 rest of it is even thicker and larger. How will this whore of your  
 even endure it?" Hsi-men Ch'ing t lifted her haunches in order to :  
 Observe the sight as he went in and out.....  
 As they talked together, the two of them had been going at it for  
 about the time it would take to eat a meal. Hsi-men Ch'ing told the  
 woman that she would have to utter promiscuously whatever :  
 Obscene sounds and wanton words,  
 occurred to her before he would come. The woman, from under-  
 neath, raised her hips with her hands, the better to receive his se-  
 men. When pleasure reaches it height passions are intense, and  
 Hsi-men Ch'ing :  
 Ejaculated like a geyser.  
 When they were finished, he retraced his organ which still carried  
 the sulfur-imbrued ring, and the woman sucked it clean for him  
 before the two of them lay down to sleep :  
 Head to head and thigh over thigh.<sup>52</sup>

Similar to his descriptive style of translating foreplay, intercourse, and oral  
 sex in *Jin Ping Mei*, Roy's descriptions of anal sex is not as stimulating as  
 Egerton's. Wang Liuer swallows Ximen Qing semen after he ejaculated as  
 Egerton describes :

The Porphyry raised herself upon her hands to receive the stream  
 of life. Hsi-mên had such an orgasm that his liquid flowed like a

<sup>52</sup> Roy, vol. 2, pp. 388-9.

torrent. He withdrew, still wearing the ring.<sup>53</sup>

Roy describes Ximen Qing orgasm as :

The woman, from underneath, raised her hips with her hands, the  
 better to receive his semen. When pleasure reaches it height pas-  
 sions are intense, and Hsi-men Ch'ing : Ejaculated like a geyser.  
 When they were finished, he retraced his organ which still carried  
 the sulfur-imbrued ring, and the woman sucked it clean for him.

While Egerton uses euphemistic terms such as "the stream of life" and  
 "liquid" to refer to Ximen Qing's semen, Roy translates *jing* 精 literally as  
 semen.

### Conclusion

After analyzing the above translations, I find that the translations of  
 all three parts are quite consistent with Egerton's and Roy's translation  
 styles which can be characterized in their first treatments of Ximen Qing's  
 penis and Pan Jinlian's vagina in Chapter 4. Egerton's pornographic trans-  
 lation gives readers more room for imagination. Although he does not do  
 word-by-word translation, his translation is artistically articulated. He em-  
 braces the freedom of faithful reproduction and makes his work entertain-  
 ing to read. Roy's translation attempts to fully reproduce the meaning  
 individual words have in the original. His work is literally more accurate  
 and intellectually more fruitful than Egerton's. Egerton and Roy represent  
 two conflicting tendencies in translation— license and fidelity. In his fa-  
 mous essay, "The Task of the Translator," Walter Benjamin points out

<sup>53</sup> Egerton, vol. 2, pp. 931.



these two crucial concepts in any discussion of translations. They are fidelity and license—the freedom of faithful reproduction and, in its served, fidelity to the word. The task of the translator, whether he chooses freedom or fidelity when translating, according to Benjamin, “consists in finding that intended effect [*Intention*] upon the language into which he is translating which produces in it in the echo of the original.”<sup>54</sup> Is it Egerton or Roy who accomplishes the task of the translator according to Benjamin’s criteria? Egerton comments on his translation and says, “I did not flatter myself that it was a perfect translation.” He continues, “I wish I had another ten years to spend on it” and “to make possible a fairly adequate rendering of what I had come to regard as a very great novel.”<sup>55</sup> Clement Egerton never had a chance to revise his translation. It was until half-a-century later, David Roy made possible a fairly adequate rendering of what Egerton had come to regard as a very great novel.

<sup>54</sup> Walter Benjamin, “The Task of the Translator” Harry Zohn trans. in *Illuminations*, Hannah Arendt ed. (New York: Harcourt, 1968), pp. 69-82.

<sup>55</sup> Egerton, “Translator’s Note,” p. 22.

## 滿文譯本《金瓶梅》敘錄

吉林大學文學院教授

王汝梅

### 一、知見版本

滿文譯本《金瓶梅》一百回，6函40冊，中央民族大學圖書館藏。框高18.5釐米，寬14釐米，白口，單魚尾，上下雙邊。半葉9行，每行字數不等，竹紙印。序署「康熙四十七年五月穀旦序」。

滿文豎排，自左往右讀。專用名詞、特殊詞語旁標注漢字，如：三國演義、水滸傳、西遊記、嚴嵩、嚴世蕃、酒色財氣等。

又見趙則誠先生藏本，版式同上，僅半部。

加拿大多倫多大學東亞圖書館藏影印滿文譯本金瓶梅，美國亞洲文化研究中心影印（可能據普林斯頓葛思德東方圖書館藏滿文本影印）。

吉林大學圖書館藏精抄本，殘存五回：第十七卷第四十八回「弄私情戲贈一枝桃 走捷徑探歸七件事」，第四十九回「請巡按屈體求榮 遇梵僧現身施藥」；第二十卷第五十五回「西門慶兩番慶壽旦 苗員外一諾送歌童」，第五十六回「西門慶捐金助朋友 常峙節得鈔仿（傲）妻兒」，第五十七回「緣簿募千金喜舍 雕欄戲一笑回嗔」。大約抄於乾隆年間，抄寫精良，裝訂考究。王麗娜介紹：北京圖書館藏有完整的四十卷本，中國社科院民族研究所、北京民族文化宮藏有殘本（《金瓶梅在國外》）。

據澤田瑞穗《增修金瓶梅研究資料要覽》著錄：天理圖書館藏《滿文金瓶梅》，全100回，40卷，80冊，內補寫13冊。

國家圖書館出版品預行編目 (CIP) 資料

臺灣金瓶梅國際學術研討會論文集. 2012 / 陳益源主編.

-- 臺北市：里仁，2013.04

冊：公分

ISBN 978-986-6178-64-1 (精裝)

1.金瓶梅 2.學術研究 3.文學評論 4.文集

857.4807

102007509

## 2012 臺灣金瓶梅國際學術研討會論文集

主辦單位：國立成功大學人文社會科學中心

主 編：陳益源

執行編輯：傅想容、柯榮三、廖凱蘋

校 對 人：作者自校、莊秋君、邱彩韻、阮黃燕  
傅筱婷、李姿瑩、林纓姿、范庭碩

發 行 人：徐秀榮

發 行 所：里仁書局 (請准註冊之商標)

臺北市仁愛路二段98號5樓之2

電話：(886-2) 2391-3325 · 2351-7610 · 2321-8231

FAX：(886-2) 3393-7766

網站：<http://lernbook.webdiy.com.tw>

郵政劃撥：01572938「里仁書局」帳戶

印 刷 所：福霖印刷有限公司

西元二〇一三年四月三十日初版

參考售價：精裝 1200 元

ISBN：978-986-6178-64-1 (精裝)